



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

NOVEMBER 13, 2019

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Wendy Edmunds
Ed Lenvik
Bill Mahan
Wayne Nemec
Robert Ooley
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Irma Unzueta, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Heidi Reidel, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Drury, Edmunds (until 4:45 p.m.), Lenvik, Mahan, Nemec, Ooley, and Veyna

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Hernandez (absent 1:54-2:51 p.m., until 3:06 p.m.), Plummer, and Krystal Vaughn, Administrative Assistant

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

Written correspondence from Anna Marie Gott was acknowledged.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **October 30, 2019**, as amended.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 6/0/3. (Hausz, abstained on Item 6, 135 East Ortega Street, and Item 7, 517 Chapala Street. Edmunds and Drury abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **November 13, 2019**, as reviewed by Commissioners Grumbine and Mahan.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Ms. Plummer announced that only two Commissioners will be absent from the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of November 27, 2019 so the meeting still has a quorum, however if any other Commissioners will be absent, they should notify staff by early next week.
2. Ms. Hernandez presented the new Historic Resources Homepage webpage.
3. Commissioner Edmunds announced she will leave at 4:45 p.m. today.

E. Subcommittee Reports:

1. Commissioner Mahan reported on the Design Awards Subcommittee meeting of November 1, 2019.
2. Commissioner Drury reported on the De La Guerra Plaza Revitalization Advisory Committee of November 8, 2019 and announced next meeting on January 30, 2019.
3. Commissioner Lenvik reported on the Designations Subcommittee meeting of November 13, 2019.

(1:50PM) CONTINUED DISCUSSION ITEM**1. AVERAGE UNIT SIZE DENSITY INCENTIVE PROGRAM AMENDMENTS: FLOOR TO LOT AREA RATIO CONCEPT AND PLANNING COMMISSION REVIEW AUTHORITY**

Application Number: PLN2019-00245

Staff: Jessica Metzger, Project Planner

(The Historic Landmarks Commission is requested to provide feedback on the concept of limiting building size by lot area and requiring additional land use approval from the Planning Commission on multiple unit residential and mixed-use projects. Historic Landmarks Commission comments will be relayed to the Planning Commission and City Council at the joint hearing on November 14th, which will focus on amending the Average Unit Size Density Incentive Program.)

Discussion was last held on October 30, 2019.

Actual time: 1:54 p.m.

Present: Jessica Metzger, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara; and Renee Brooke, City Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:12 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. John Campanella
2. Mary Louise Days
3. Anne Petersen
4. Rick Closson

Written correspondence from Francesca Galt and Sally Sphar was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:22 p.m.

Discussion held.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support the proposed Floor to Lot Area Ratio changes?
9/0 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support a deference to a close historic resource? 9/0
Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support the proposed Floor to Lot Area Ratio changes if
the HLC is heavily involved in the process? 9/0 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support a threshold of 10,000 square feet to trigger
Planning Commission review? 9/0 Passed

(2:35PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM

2. 1514 GARDEN ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-251-020

Reference Number: PLN2019-00234

Owner: Edward St. George

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on February 5, 2020 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Italianate style house constructed in c. 1875 located at 1514 Garden Street.)

Actual time: 2:51 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, City Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:52 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2019-14 to hold a Public Hearing on February 5, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Italianate style house constructed in c. 1875 located at 1514 Garden Street.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

(2:40PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**3. 1520 GARDEN ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-251-021
Reference Number: PLN2019-00234
Owner: Edward St. George

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on February 5, 2020 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Gothic Revival style house constructed in c. 1874 located at 1520 Garden Street.)

Actual time: 2:52 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, City Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:53 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2019-15 to hold a Public Hearing on February 5, 2019 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Gothic Revival style house constructed in c. 1874 located at 1520 Garden Street.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

(2:45PM) MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM**4. 2190 ALSTON ROAD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 015-174-019
Reference Number: PLN2019-00234
Owner: Ok Wave, LLC, A California Limited Liability Company

(Review of Staff Report and Public Hearing to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Grahlm Estate, a Spanish Colonial Revival style house designed in 1920 by Roland Frederick Sauter located at 2190 Alston Road.)

Actual time: 2:53 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, City Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:57 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Adopt Resolution 2019-141 to designate as a Structure of Merit the Grahlm Estate, a Spanish Colonial Revival style house designed in 1920 by Roland Frederick Sauter located at 2190 Alston Road.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

(2:55PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**5. 574 RICARDO AVE**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 035-131-007
Zone: RS-15
Application Number: PLN2019-00215
Owner: Reward Ventures LLC
Applicant: Penn Hsu

(Proposal to demolish 1,324 square feet of an existing single-unit residence. The project will construct a new two-story 2,433 square foot residence with 499 square feet of additions on the first floor, and 610 square feet of additions on the second floor. The attached 499 square foot two-car garage is to remain. The project also includes a new 280 square foot deck. The proposed total 2,433 square feet of development on a 7,400 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District is 94% of the maximum allowable floor-to-lot area ratio.)

Requesting acceptance of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by Brent Leftwich.

Actual time: 2:58 p.m.

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations.

Public comment opened at 2:59 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Brian Moulton
2. Grant Endo, opposed
3. Sumiko Endo, opposed

Public comment closed at 3:04 p.m.

Motion: Accept the Phase I Archaeological Resources Report as presented.

Action: Hausz/Mahan, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:06 TO 3:16 P.M. ***

(3:00PM) PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW**6. 400-1200 BLOCK STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-1879, -1924, -1828, -1776, -3368, -1700, -1646, -1578, -1515, -1444
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PLN2019-00546
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Geiska Velasquez

(This is a One-Time Pre-Application Consultation. Proposal to permanently install stringed decorative lights between existing lampposts along both sides of State Street from Gutierrez Street to Victoria Street. The lights would be strung along steel wires to maximize longevity and reduce swag. The purpose of the proposal is to increase pedestrian safety on State Street after sunset, and is intended for use outside of the annual Downtown Organization Holiday Lighting.)

This is a One-Time Pre-Application Consultation. No final appealable decision will be made at this hearing.

Actual time: 3:15 p.m.

Present: Victor Garza, Downtown Plaza & Parking Manager, City of Santa Barbara; and Geiska Velasquez, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Pilar Plummer stated that the applicant is here for a one-time consultation to discuss general supportability of having string lights on a permanent basis, outside of our standard holiday lighting. The Commission has the flexibility to consider if 1) the string lights are generally acceptable, 2) an alternate type of string lights is more acceptable, or 3) string lights are not acceptable.

Public comment opened at 3:25 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Rick Closson, opposed. Cathy Closson ceded time to Mr. Closson.
2. Carrie Kelly, support
3. Aaron Ashland, support
4. Matt LaBrie, support

Public comment closed at 3:37 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support more light on State Street? 9/0 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support more thoughtfully designed light on State Street? 9/0 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support extending the holiday lighting this year? 7/2 Passed

Commission comments:

In general, the Commission is supportive of enhanced lighting on State Street, but suggests alternatives to the currently hung string lights, including lessening the number of lights and studying string lights with a hood. Any proposed lighting should be artistic and with design intent.

1. Commissioner Hausz is opposed to string lighting, feels that they look like a carnival, increase potential sky glow, and in general are not necessary to promote lighting on State Street. Believes they are antithetical to the tenets of the lighting guidelines and are not consistent with El Pueblo Viejo. If pursued, string lights with hoods would be key and spacing would be important, with two or three lights between poles.
2. Commissioner Mahan feels that decorative lighting is good for downtown Santa Barbara. It needs to be festive and fun. The lights installed at the 500 Block of State Street are currently too close together and straight. They need to have poetry, a catenary droop, and be designed artistically and interestingly instead of just straight. Can be supportive if installed properly with design and style. Must be considerate of residents in the downtown. Suggests shutting the lights off at some point at night.
3. Commissioner Edmunds supports the comments of other Commissioners and feels State Street does need a more festive lighting experience. Should consider a more European look and be hung stylistically. Concerned a little about potential light exposure to residential units along State Street.
4. Commissioner Veyna can be supportive of the street lights and suggests increasing the candlepower along State Street and adding lateral arms on existing lampposts.
5. Commissioner Lenvik is in support of providing more light on State Street as it is necessary for enhancing the attractiveness of the street and promoting business and foot traffic. String light design is very static and lacks poetry. The string lighting on the wharf is very static. Showed photo of lights in Paseo Nuevo as an example of what can be done on State Street and suggested lighting the upper area of the trees rather than the whole tree. A lighting designer might be helpful in this case. Lighting should be art so the public comes to see the lighting as well as the buildings.
6. Commissioner Nemec supports lighting on State Street as the street currently seems dead at night and could use improvement. Many cities get a lot of revenue at night. Hooded string lights would help with light pollution and also allow the implementation of artistry. Lighting of trees is very important and suggests pendant lights, as seen at the County Bowl.
7. Commissioner Drury supports comments made by Commissioners Hausz and Lenvik. This proposal is in its infancy, however the lighting is more about safety. Replace the lights that are up now with some that have hoods to test that theory. State Street needs help and it benefits the City to study the potential of string lighting. Suggests tin hoods and appropriate LED lighting underneath. State Street is showing signs of resurgence.
8. Commissioner Ooley is not supportive of the proposed string lights, believing that they cheapen the look of State Street. Understands the need for new lighting but does not feel string lights are the answer, especially when applicants come in with string lights and the Commission has them pursue wrought iron fixtures.

9. Chair Grumbine agrees that during the day, string lights cheapen the façade of the cityscape. There might be a way to get light on State Street with a more artistic solution.

(3:40PM) PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL

7. 1220-1222 STATE ST & 20 E VICTORIA ST

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-061, -060, -059, -058, -056, -055, -025, -020, -003

Zone: C-G

Application Number: PLN2016-00555

Owner: Nassau Land Company, L.P.

1216 State Street, LLC

Mary Lewis, Trustee & Elizabeth T. Bilich, Trustee

Eric S. Meyer & Cynthia C. Meyer

Steven F. Barnes, Trustee & John H. Parke, Trustee

Applicant: The Towbes Group, Inc.

Architect: The Cearnal Collective, LLP

(The project consists of a merger of nine lots totaling 0.74 acres and a subsequent re-subdivision to create seven lots. Proposed lot sizes range from 596 square feet to 13,022 square feet. The project includes exterior improvements, such as lighting, paving and walls, to create "Granada Plaza," an enhanced paseo connection between State and the Granada Garage (City Parking Lot 6); defined bus/truck parking for the Granada Theatre; a new shared trash enclosure; and two new private garages of 546 and 653 net square feet. The paseo to State Street is proposed to be dedicated to the City. A Tentative Subdivision Map was approved by Planning Commission allowing for the division of nine parcels into seven lots.)

Project Design Approval is requested. Project requires consistency with the Project Compatibility Criteria and Planning Commission Resolution No. 021-18. Project was last reviewed on March 21, 2018.

Actual time: 4:06 p.m.

Present: Brian Cearnal, Architect, The Cearnal Collective; Craig Minus, Project Manager, Towbes Group; Eric S. Meyer, Owner; and Megan Arciniega, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Planning Commission approved the Tentative Subdivision Map for the project. If Project Design Approval is granted the Project Compatibility Criteria will have to be made.

Public comment opened at 4:22 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Erick Myer, support
2. Dan Burnham, support
3. Matt LaBrie, support

Public comment closed at 4:27 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support additional study of decorative elements for the string lighting? 6/1 Passed

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support the lighting as is? 1/6 Failed

Motion: Project Design Approval with the following comments and findings and to return to the Full Commission for in-progress review with the following conditions met:

1. Provide a warmer concrete tone for the private area; scored concrete is acceptable.
2. The rendering is acceptable as submitted.
3. The current garage design is acceptable.
4. Return with specifications for the cove lighting.
5. Return with alternate designs for the string lighting, including raised poles, hoods, and more catenary swag.
6. The interior garage lighting should be warm and have reduced intensity.
7. The Commission finds that the Compatibility Analysis Criteria generally have been met (per SBMC 22.22.145.B.) as follows:
 - a. The project fully complies with all applicable City Charter and Municipal Code requirements. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
 - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
 - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate for its location and neighborhood.
 - d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
 - e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
 - f. The project includes an appropriate amount of open space and landscaping.

Action: Mahan/Hausz, 7/0/1. (Nemec abstained. Edmunds absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:58 P.M. ***